BALDWINSVILLE CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT

Independent Internal Audit Report Capital Projects and Capital Assets

July 1, 2020 - June 30, 2021



April 19, 2021

Audit Committee Members Baldwinsville Central School District 1 Buccaneer Boulevard Oswego, New York 13126

Dear Audit Committee Members:

Bonadio & Co., LLP was engaged by the Baldwinsville Central School District (the District) to fulfill the requirements of the Internal Audit Function in accordance with the provisions of the 2005 Public School District Accountability Act. We have been contracted by the District to evaluate the policies and procedures in place regarding the internal controls over the capital assets and capital projects function.

The results of our testing, which are included in this report, have been communicated to the District Administration. District Administration has responded to this report under separate cover.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the District Administration, the Audit Committee, and others within the District and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than those specified parties.

We would like to acknowledge the cooperation extended to us during our examination by the employees of the District.

If you have any questions concerning this report, please feel free to contact us at any time.

Very truly yours,

BONADIO & CO., LLP

bv:

Keeley Ann Hines, CPA

432 North Franklin Street, #60 Syracuse, New York 13204 p (315) 476-4004 f (315) 254-2384

www.bonadio.com

SECTION I: EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Purpose and Scope

The objective of this engagement is to perform reconciliations of capital asset activity per the general ledger and supporting schedules to that of the audited financial statements for the period of June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020. Furthermore, B&Co will consider the design and effectiveness of the internal control environment surrounding the capital assets and capital projects function of the Baldwinsville Central School District (the District).

In performing our engagement, we relied on the accuracy and reliability of information provided by District personnel. We have not audited, examined or reviewed the information, and express no assurance on it. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters may have come to our attention that would have been reported to you in our Observations and Recommendations section of this report.

Responses from Administration

The Districts Administration's responses to our observations identified in our report are described as part of a corrective action plan assembled by Administration under separate cover. We did not audit the District responses and, accordingly, we express no opinion on them.

Confidentiality

This report is confidential and should be distributed only to those with a need to know and who are authorized to the information; the District Board of Education, the District Superintendent, or the Assistant Superintendent for Administration. Bonadio & Co., LLP (B&Co.), the Internal Auditors, must approve the release of this report to anyone outside the District.

SECTION II: APPROACH TO ENGAGEMENT

Scope:

June 30, 2016 – June 30, 2020

Sources of Information and Key Documents:

- Client inquiries
- Board Policies and Procedures
- Fixed Asset Detail Reports
- Audited Financial Statements
- Records produced by Fiscal Advisors
- General Ledger Details
- Listing of approved capital projects
- Reconciliations and source documents produced and maintained by management

Internal Controls:

Obtained an understanding of internal controls over tracking and recording expenditures and journal entries related to capital projects and capital assets. We obtained the District's capital asset policy and it was reasonable and consistent with industry norms. Furthermore, the policy is current and has been approved by the Board of Education. The policy includes, but is not limited to: approval limits for purchases and disposals, limits for expensing an item or capitalizing an item as well as useful lives and depreciation methods.

Procedures:

- Identified funding sources and reviewed project budgets
- Obtained schedules of construction in progress to reconcile and identify differences, if applicable, to that of the expenditures recorded in the financial statements
- Traced current year additions per fixed asset details to construction in progress in the financial statements and identified differences, when applicable
- Reconciled activity recorded in the Capital Projects Fund with that of the activity recorded in capital assets in the financial statements and identified differences, when applicable
- For completed capital projects, we obtained journal entries made related to the close out of the project(s) and ensured remaining funds were transferred to the appropriate fund(s)
- For completed projects, trace the completed project to depreciable assets ensuring it was appropriately transferred out of construction in progress and agree this to audited financial statements and identify differences, when applicable
- Reconciled and identified differences, when applicable, in fixed assets records maintained by management to that of the audited financial statements

SECTION III: OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Observation

In reviewing the fixed asset detail (document name: OCM BOCES Asset Accounting Ledger – By Fund Detail) provided for the years ended June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020, we noted a number of variances between this and the audited and issued financial statements, as illustrated Attachment A.

Recommendation

We recommend the District perform an annual reconciliation of capital assets (cost basis as well as accumulated depreciation) per the fixed asset listing provided by OCM BOCES to the yearend audited financial statements. Differences should be investigated, and when necessary, adjustments should be recorded timely.

2. Observation

For capital projects in which expenditures were incurred during the years June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020, we viewed the general ledger detail and compared those amounts to that of the expenditures capitalized per the fixed asset detail (document name: OCM BOCES Asset Accounting Ledger – By Fund Detail) and noted the following accumulated differences by project:

Project Name	<u>Per</u>	<u>Capital Asset</u> <u>Detail</u>	<u>Per General</u> Ledger	Difference
Security Projects - 2018 Project	\$	877,649	\$ 5,540,488	\$ (4,662,839)
\$32 million project - 2016 Project		20,725,020	27,403,909	(6,678,889)
2018 Energy Performance (EPC)		73,488	3,460,801	(3,387,313)
\$18.5 million - 2014 Project		5,637,171	18,480,706	(12,843,535)
Smart School Bond Act		230,320	1,264,922	(1,034,602)
2008-09 Renovation Project		8,970,137	26,105,000	(17,134,863)
Unidentified Capitalized Costs		26,887,875	-	26,887,875
	\$	63,401,660	\$ 82,255,826	\$ (18,854,166)

Recommendation

Similar to the Recommendation in Observation No. 1, we recommend the District perform an annual reconciliation of capital expenditures per the general ledger to the fixed asset listing (document name: OCM BOCES Asset Accounting Ledger – By Fund Detail).

3. Observation

Per review of the financial statements for the periods of June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020 (See Attachment B), we noted a number of instances the District did not record construction in process to reflect those expenditures incurred on future depreciable assets that were not yet completed and in use. Rather, the District recorded activity directly as additions to depreciable assets resulting in depreciation expense being recorded prior to completion of the project. This is inconsistent with generally accepted accounting principles. We do however note that in FYE 2020, additions to construction in progress were recorded in the amount of \$13,647,943, which agrees to the capital outlay expenditures in the Capital Projects Fund. See Observation No. 5 for more information related to this subject matter.

Recommendation

B&Co. recommends the District adopt a policy to track ongoing capital project expenditures as construction in progress, a non-depreciable asset in the fixed asset detail, as well as in the financial statements. Once a project is completed the full amount of expenditures for the project should be transferred out of construction in progress and into depreciable capital assets.

4. Observation

For those capital projects, deemed significant in size, with expenditures incurred during the years June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020, we viewed general ledger detail and compared expenditures to figures provided by Fiscal Advisors on the project tracking spreadsheets and final cost reports and identified differences between the two sources.

For those capital projects, deemed significant in size, with expenditures incurred during the years June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020, we viewed general ledger detail and compared expenditures to approved budget amounts and noted instances in which expenditures exceeded the budget.

For those capital projects, deemed significant in size, with expenditures incurred during the years June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020, we noted that some projects that have been completed, have leftover funds with no proper closeout entries made to transfer remaining funds back to the General Fund, or to another project. We did not note any instances where there were unspent bond proceeds for a completed project that would need to be transferred to the Debt Service fund.

See Attachment D for a schedule of differences noted above.

Recommendation

B&Co. recommends the District perform an ongoing reconciliation of capital expenditures per the general ledger and the information maintained by Fiscal Advisors for each individual project. Furthermore, we recommend the District perform a reconciliation of remaining funds at the completion of each project, and make appropriate transfers on a timely basis, as necessary. Projects should then be properly classified as "closed".

5. Observation

As demonstrated in Attachment C, on a number of occasions during the period of June 30, 2016 through June 30, 2020, we were unable to reconcile the capital outlay expenditures recorded in the Capital Projects Fund to that of the additions to capital assets (construction in progress or additions to depreciable assets) in the capital assets footnote. It is however noted that as of June 30, 2020, the total additions to construction in progress is \$13,647,943 of which agreed to the total capital outlays in the Capital Projects Fund, with zero variance.

Recommendation

We recommend that all expenditure activity within the Capital Projects Fund be reconciled to that of the capital asset additions to ensure completeness and existence. At minimum, this process should be done annually. Adjustments should be made as deemed necessary.

6. Observation

Prior to June 30, 2020 the District does not track capital project budgets within WINCAP. Additionally, budget to actual is not actively tracked by the District, but rather by Fiscal Advisors.

Recommendation

Per discussion with the District, capital project budgets after June 30, 2020 are now being tracked in WINCAP. We recommend the District monitor budget to actual for the project(s) on an ongoing basis and appropriately close out each project once completed.

Attachment A

June 30, 2016				
	Asset Detail	<u>F/S</u>	Differences	
Nondepreciable Assets:				
Land	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	0.00%
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Depreciable Assets:				
Buildings & Improvements		121,213,704		
Machinery and Equipment		14,236,557		
Total depreciable assets	137,597,246	135,450,261	2,146,985	1.56%
Accumulated Depreciation:				
Buildings & Improvements		(40,062,933)		
Machinery and Equipment		(9,872,289)		
Total accumulated depreciation	(60,680,650)	(49,935,222)	(10,745,428)	17.71%
	78,960,287	87,554,538	(8,594,251)	-10.88%

June 30, 2017

5, 2017	Asset Detail	F/S	Differences	
Nondepreciable Assets:	ricoot Dotain		2111010110000	
Land	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	0.00%
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Depreciable Assets:				
Buildings & Improvements		132,875,755		
Machinery and Equipment		14,509,590		
Total depreciable assets	149,693,026	147,385,345	2,307,681	1.54%
Accumulated Depreciation:				
Buildings & Improvements		(42,262,690)		
Machinery and Equipment		(10,043,930)		
Total accumulated depreciation	(60,717,803)	(52,306,620)	(8,411,183)	13.85%
	91,018,914	97,118,224	(6,099,310)	-6.70%

June 30, 2018

,	Asset Detail	<u>F/S</u>	Differences	
Nondepreciable Assets:				
Land	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	0.00%
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Depreciable Assets:				
Buildings & Improvements		145,410,392		
Machinery and Equipment		15,331,903		
Total depreciable assets	163,196,536	160,742,295	2,454,241	1.50%
Accumulated Depreciation:				
Buildings & Improvements		(44,696,415)		
Machinery and Equipment		(10,551,139)		
Total accumulated depreciation	(60,812,217)	(55,247,554)	(5,564,663)	9.15%
	104,428,010	107,534,240	(3,106,230)	-2.97%

June 30, 2019

	Asset Detail	<u>F/S</u>	Differences	
Nondepreciable Assets:				
Land	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	0.00%
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Depreciable Assets:				
Buildings & Improvements		157,118,406		
Machinery and Equipment		16,834,699		
Total depreciable assets	176,488,217	173,953,105	2,535,112	1.44%
Accumulated Depreciation:				
Buildings & Improvements		(47,380,145)		
Machinery and Equipment		(10,952,900)		
Total accumulated depreciation	(60,108,945)	(58,333,045)	(1,775,900)	2.95%
	118,422,963	117,659,559	763,404	0.64%
June 30, 2020				
	Asset Detail	<u>F/S</u>	Differences	
Nondepreciable Assets:				
Land	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	0.00%
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,043,691	2,039,499	4,192	0.21%
Depreciable Assets:				
Buildings & Improvements		170,540,543		
Machinery and Equipment		17,823,526		
Total depreciable assets	190,912,047	188,364,069	2,547,978	1.33%
Accumulated Depreciation:				
Buildings & Improvements		(50,299,459)		
Machinery and Equipment		(11,677,132)		
Total accumulated depreciation	(63,714,398)	(61,976,591)	(1,737,807)	2.73%

Attachment B

	Jur	ne 30, 2016 - Fin	ancial Statements	S
	Beginning			Ending
	Balance	Additions	Reductions	Balance
Nondepreciable Assets:				
Land	1,833,691	205,808	-	2,039,499
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	-
Total Nondepreciable assets	1,833,691	205,808	-	2,039,499
Depreciable Assets:				-
Buildings & Improvements	116,361,297	4,852,407	-	121,213,704
Machinery and Equipment	13,490,493	1,259,178	513,114	14,236,557
Total depreciable assets	129,851,790	6,111,585	513,114	135,450,261
Accumulated Depreciation:				
Buildings & Improvements	(37,964,070)	(2,098,863)	-	(40,062,933)
Machinery and Equipment	(9,321,727)	(1,063,676)	(513,114)	(9,872,289)
Total accumulated depreciation	(47,285,797)	(3,162,539)	(513,114)	(49,935,222)
	84,399,684	3,154,854		87,554,538

	June 30, 2017 - Financial Statements						
	Beginning			Ending			
	Balance	Additions	Reductions	Balance			
Nondepreciable Assets:							
Land	2,039,499	-	-	2,039,499			
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	-			
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,039,499	-	-	2,039,499			
Depreciable Assets:				-			
Buildings & Improvements	121,213,704	11,662,051	-	132,875,755			
Machinery and Equipment	14,236,557	1,139,575	866,542	14,509,590			
Total depreciable assets	135,450,261	12,801,626	866,542	147,385,345			
Accumulated Depreciation:							
Buildings & Improvements	(40,062,933)	(2,199,757)	-	(42,262,690)			
Machinery and Equipment	(9,872,289)	(1,038,183)	(866,542)	(10,043,930)			
Total accumulated depreciation	(49,935,222)	(3,237,940)	(866,542)	(52,306,620)			
	87,554,538	9,563,686	_	97,118,224			

June 30, 2018 - Financial Statements						
Beginning			Ending			
Balance	Additions	Reductions	Balance			
2,039,499	-	-	2,039,499			
-	-	-	-			
2,039,499	-	-	2,039,499			
			-			
132,875,755	12,534,637	-	145,410,392			
14,509,590	1,338,478	516,165	15,331,903			
147,385,345	13,873,115	516,165	160,742,295			
(42,262,690)	(2,433,725)	-	(44,696,415)			
(10,043,930)	(1,013,442)	(506,233)	(10,551,139)			
(52,306,620)	(3,447,167)	(506,233)	(55,247,554)			
97,118,224	10,425,948	9,932	107,534,240			
	Beginning Balance 2,039,499 - 2,039,499 132,875,755 14,509,590 147,385,345 (42,262,690) (10,043,930) (52,306,620)	Beginning Balance Additions 2,039,499 - - - 2,039,499 - - - 2,039,499 - - - 2,039,499 - 132,875,755 12,534,637 14,509,590 1,338,478 147,385,345 13,873,115 (42,262,690) (2,433,725) (10,043,930) (1,013,442) (52,306,620) (3,447,167)	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			

	Jur	ne 30, 2019 - Fin	ancial Statement	S
	Beginning			Ending
	Balance	Additions	Reductions	Balance
Nondepreciable Assets:				
Land	2,039,499	-	-	2,039,499
Construction in Progress	-	-	-	-
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,039,499	-	-	2,039,499
Depreciable Assets:				-
Buildings & Improvements	145,410,392	11,708,014	-	157,118,406
Machinery and Equipment	15,331,903	2,622,132	1,119,336	16,834,699
Total depreciable assets	160,742,295	14,330,146	1,119,336	173,953,105
Accumulated Depreciation:				
Buildings & Improvements	(44,696,415)	(2,683,730)	-	(47,380,145)
Machinery and Equipment	(10,551,139)	(1,459,070)	(1,057,309)	(10,952,900)
Total accumulated depreciation	(55,247,554)	(4,142,800)	(1,057,309)	(58,333,045)
	107,534,240	10,187,346	62,027	117,659,559

	June 30, 2020 - Financial Statements						
	Beginning			Ending			
	Balance	Additions	Reductions	Balance			
Nondepreciable Assets:							
Land	2,039,499	-	-	2,039,499			
Construction in Progress	-	13,647,943	13,647,943	-			
Total Nondepreciable assets	2,039,499	13,647,943	13,647,943	2,039,499			
Depreciable Assets:				-			
Buildings & Improvements	157,118,406	13,422,137	-	170,540,543			
Machinery and Equipment	16,834,699	1,738,227	749,400	17,823,526			
Total depreciable assets	173,953,105	15,160,364	749,400	188,364,069			
Accumulated Depreciation:							
Buildings & Improvements	(47,380,145)	(2,919,314)	-	(50,299,459)			
Machinery and Equipment	(10,952,900)	(1,473,632)	(749,400)	(11,677,132)			
Total accumulated depreciation	(58,333,045)	(4,392,946)	(749,400)	(61,976,591)			
	117,659,559	24,415,361	13,647,943	128,426,977			

Attachment C

Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2016

per GL	Per	Financial Statem	ents			Per Financial Statements			
<u>Capital</u> Expenditures	<u>Cap Projects</u> Cap Outlays	<u>Cap Projects</u> <u>Pupil</u> <u>Transport</u>	<u>Total Cap</u> Projects Expenditures	Difference	<u>Land</u> Additions to Cap Assets	<u>CIP</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Depreciable Additions to Cap Assets	<u>Total</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Difference
5,918,971	4,852,408	1,066,563	5,918,971	-	205,808	-	6,111,585	6,317,393	(398,422)
А			В	A-B				С	B-C

Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2017

per GL	Per F	inancial Statem	ents			Per Financia			
<u>Capital</u> Expenditures	<u>Cap Projects</u> <u>Cap Outlays</u>	<u>Cap Projects</u> <u>Pupil</u> <u>Transport</u>	<u>Total Cap</u> Projects Expenditures	Difference	<u>Land</u> Additions to Cap Assets	<u>CIP</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Depreciable Additions to Cap Assets	<u>Total</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Difference
13,021,817 D	11,627,280	977,675	12,604,955 E	416,862 <mark>D-E</mark>	-	-	12,801,626	12,801,626 F	(196,671) <mark>E-F</mark>

Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2018

per GL	Per l			
<u>Capital</u> Expenditures	<u>Cap Projects</u> <u>Cap Outlays</u>	<u>Cap Projects</u> <u>Pupil</u> <u>Transport</u>	<u>Total Cap</u> Projects Expenditures	Difference
14,429,935	13,265,624	1,164,311	14,429,935	-
G			Н	G-H

<u>Land</u> Additions to Cap Assets	<u>CIP</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Depreciable Additions to Cap Assets	<u>Total</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Difference
-	-	13,873,115	13,873,115	556,820
			l l	H-I

Per Financial Statements

Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2019

per GL	Per l	-				
<u>Capital</u> Expenditures	Cap Projects Cap Outlays	<u>Cap Projects</u> <u>Pupil</u> <u>Transport</u>	<u>Total Cap</u> Projects Expenditures	Difference		
12,788,854	11,720,213	1,066,330	12,786,543	2,311		
J			K	J-K		

<u>Land</u> Additions to Cap Assets	<u>CIP</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Depreciable Additions to Cap Assets	<u>Total</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Difference
-	-	14,330,146	14,330,146	(1,543,603) K-I
			L	IX-L

Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2020

per Gl		Per l			
<u>Capita</u> Expendite		Cap Projects Cap Outlays	<u>Cap Projects</u> <u>Pupil</u> <u>Transport</u>	<u>Total Cap</u> Projects Expenditures	Difference
14,774	,530	13,647,943	1,126,587	14,774,530	-
М				N	M-N

<u>Land</u> Additions to Cap Assets	<u>CIP</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Depreciable Additions to Cap Assets	CIP Disposal	<u>Total</u> Additions to Cap Assets	Difference
-	13,647,943	15,160,364	(13,647,943)	15,160,364	(385,834)
				0	N-0

Attachment D

Project Name	Original Budget	в	Serial onds/BANS	Grants	Capital Reserve Transfer	otal Funding Sources	•	Excess Shortage) of ^F unding vs. Budget	xr1 xpenditures per Fiscal Advisors	[A-B Difference
Security Projects - 2018 Project	\$ 4,310,000	\$	3,480,000	\$ -	\$ 830,000	\$ 4,310,000	\$	-	\$ 2,457,726	\$	1,852,274
\$32 million project - 2016 Project	\$ 32,432,400	\$	28,932,400	\$ -	\$ 3,500,000	\$ 32,432,400	\$	-	31,725,225	\$	707,175
2018 Energy Performance (EPC)	\$ 3,452,072	\$	3,452,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 3,452,000	\$	(72)	3,462,852	\$	(10,780) *
\$18.5 million - 2014 Project	\$ 18,500,000	\$	16,700,000	\$ -	\$ 1,800,000	\$ 18,500,000	\$	-	18,886,085	\$	(386,085) *
Smart School Bond Act	\$ 2,736,541	\$	2,013,575	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2,013,575	\$	(722,966)	1,270,337	\$	1,466,204
2008-09 Renovation Project	\$ 26,500,000 A	\$	21,724,000	\$ 1,932,373	\$ 3,000,000	\$ 26,656,373	\$	156,373	25,679,890 B	\$	820,110

* The difference indicates expenditures exceeded the original approved budgeted amounts for this project

Project Name	Prior Expenditures	6/30/2016	6/30/2017	6/30/2017 6/30/2018 6/30/2019			Total Expenditures per General Ledger	Expenditures per Fiscal Advisors	Difference GL vs. Fiscal Advisors
Security Projects - 2018 Project	\$ -	\$-	\$ -	\$ 193,037	\$ 558,427	\$ 4,789,025	\$ 5,540,488	\$ 2,457,726	\$ 3,082,763
\$32 million project - 2016 Project	-	767,628	1,402,482	5,833,900	10,946,298	8,453,601	27,403,909	31,725,225	\$ (4,321,316)
2018 Energy Performance (EPC)	-	-	-	3,387,313	73,488	-	3,460,801	3,462,852	\$ (2,051)
\$18.5 million - 2014 Project	1,688,062	3,984,780	10,124,798	2,683,066	-	-	18,480,706	18,886,085	\$ (405,379)
Smart School Bond Act	-	-	-	1,022,280	42,000	200,642	1,264,922	1,270,337	\$ (5,415)
2008-09 Renovation Project	25,688,138		416,862	-	-	-	26,105,000	25,679,890	\$ 425,110
	\$ 27,376,200	\$ 4,752,408	\$ 11,944,142	\$ 13,119,595	\$ 11,620,213	\$ 13,443,268	\$ 82,255,826	\$ 83,482,114	-
								xr1	_